



Two Spanish inventions in the XV – century



SALES:

<http://www.lulu.com/spotlight/moriscoricote>

Academia de Estudios Humanísticos de Blanca, 2016, N° 4, pp. 1-7  
DOI: 10.13140/RG.2.2.31720.67848



(c) **Govert Westerveld** - Chess & Draughts historian  
Member of the Asociación Internacional de Hispanistas

## ***Lazarillo de Tormes* and *La Celestina*. Why Jordi Bilbeny Is Right**

In 2007 Jordi Bilbeny published a book in which the author claims that *Lazarillo de Tormes* was Valencian and attributes the book to Joan Timoneda<sup>1</sup>. He has other interesting and revolutionary findings, such as that the Aragonese author of *La Celestina* is from Valencia. With this affirmation he is on the same line as our findings<sup>2</sup>. To highlight Bilbeny's brilliant research capacity, this study concentrates only on the authorship of *Lazarillo de Tormes*. To check the validity of Bilbeny's findings we have used the JGAAP program.

JGAAP is quite an interesting program, but it is still not perfect. On the other hand we do not consider ourselves experts in using this program. Although our way of working has its doubts, some conclusions can be made with JGAAP used for identification of authorship. However, this program has its limitations and so we have to be careful in accepting what the program points at. It is necessary to find additional proofs to be sure of the findings of JGAAP.

Authorship Attribution is a long-standing problem in text analysis, and indeed in the humanities in general. Law enforcement and forensic scientists are interested in these methods; Chaski reports on a court case where a body was discovered near a computer with an apparent suicide note typed into it. In case of a hand-written note, of course, handwriting specialists could be called in to verify that the note was in the handwriting of the deceased, but one flat-ASCII 'A' looks identical to any other. What was needed instead was an analysis based on writing style, and Chaski was able to prove that the deceased did not write the note, and a murder had been committed<sup>3</sup>.

---

<sup>1</sup> **BILBENY, Jordi** (2007) *L'Enciclopèdia cat.* Barcelona: Grup Enciclopèdia Catalana

<sup>2</sup> **WESTERVELD, Govert** (2016) *Researches on the Mysterious Aragonese Author of La Celestina.* Academia de Estudios Humanísticos de Blanca. 288 pages

<sup>3</sup> **JUOLA, Patrick** (2009) *JGAAP: A System for Comparative Evaluation of Authorship Attribution.* In: JDHCS, Volume 1, Number 1, pp. 1-5



Two Spanish inventions in the XV – century



SALES:

<http://www.lulu.com/spotlight/moriscoricote>

Academia de Estudios Humanísticos de Blanca, 2016, N° 4, pp. 1-7

DOI: 10.13140/RG.2.2.31720.67848



The JGAAP authorship identification tool can help us compare texts by writers known to us from the 15th century with the texts that we possess by unknown authors. We have to rely on the well-tested assumption that people have a distinct way of writing. The characteristics manifest themselves in how writers use words, spell certain words, structure sentences, and through many other individualities. Using JGAAP we formed a database of at least 50 authors known to us from the 15th century. We used a text of about 5,000 words by each writer. With respect to the authors unknown to us we tried to use the text of an unknown author of a minimum of 500 words. However this is not always possible. We must also understand that the 5,000 words by an author could not always be 100% by the author. Authors in those times had the habit of copying texts of other writers and it will be clear to the lector that in such case the pattern is not 100% pure.

According to the user guide of JGAAP 5.1. one has to work in the following way:

Canonizers:            Normalize Whitespace - Normalize ASCII  
 Event Drivers:        Character NGrams N: 4  
                               (others<sup>4</sup> use NGrams N: 2)  
 Event Cullers:        Most Common Events N: 50  
 Analysis method:    Nearest Neighbor Driver  
                               with metric Cosine Distance

### Some possible authors

Professor Rosa Navarro Durán<sup>5</sup>, professor of Spanish Literature at the University of Barcelona, came up in 2003 with the hypothesis that Alfonso de Valdés (Basel 1490 - Vienna 1532), secretary of the Latin letters of the Emperor, could be the anonymous author of this work. Also at that time Jose Luis Madrigal, doctor of Hispanic Literature at the University of the City of New York, affirmed that Francisco Cervantes de Salazar could be the author of *Lazarillo de Tormes*. Francisco Rico quickly stated that the two investigators were wrong and *Lazarillo* is not an anonymous, but apocryphal work: it is well signed by Lázaro de Tormes.

<sup>4</sup> GUPTA, Ravi & BROOKS, Hugh (2013) Using Social Media for Global Security. John Wiley & Sons, Inc., Indianapolis, Indiana, p. 154.

<sup>5</sup> NAVARRO DURÁN, Rosa (2003) Alfonso de Valdés, autor del *Lazarillo de Tormes*, Madrid, Gredos



Two Spanish inventions in the XV – century



SALES:

<http://www.lulu.com/spotlight/moriscoricote>

Academia de Estudios Humanísticos de Blanca, 2016, N° 4, pp. 1-7

DOI: 10.13140/RG.2.2.31720.67848



Valentín Pérez Vénzala also does not believe in the authorship of Alfonso de Valdés and points out that as early as 1976 Joseph V. Ricapito<sup>6</sup> formulated this possibility with the same arguments as those of Professor Navarro. Another strong criticism came from Francisco Calero Calero<sup>7</sup>, a professor of Latin Philology at the UNED, who bluntly asserted that the author of *Lazarillo* is Juan Luis Vives. According to this researcher, if the scholars had read Vives in Latin, they would have been detected earlier with the author of *Lazarillo*. Calero said that "Luis Vives wrote all his work in Latin, except:

Diálogo de Mercurio y Carón<sup>8</sup>

Diálogo en que particularmente se tratan las cosas acaecidas en Roma el año MDXXVII

Diálogo de la Lengua

El *Lazarillo*

### Other possible authors

Marcel Bataillon<sup>9</sup> thought that fray Juan de Ortega was the author of *El Lazarillo*. Mercedes Agulló y Cobo<sup>10</sup> attributed the authorship to Diego Hurtado de Horozo. Julio Cejador<sup>11</sup>, as well as Francisco Márquez Villanueva<sup>12</sup>, believed more in the author Sebastián de Horozco. Fonger de Haan<sup>13</sup> thought in 1903 that the author was Lope de Rueda. Pedro de Rúa<sup>14</sup> stated that Hernánd Núñez (El Comendador Griego) could have been the author of *El Lazarillo*. José Luis Madrigal<sup>15</sup> had another hypothesis in 2008 that Juan Arce de Otálora was the author. Clark Colahan and Alfred Rodríguez believed in 1995 more in Juan Maldonado<sup>16</sup>.

<sup>6</sup> RICAPITO, Joseph V. (1985) *Lazarillo de Tormes*, ed. de Joseph V. Ricapito, Cátedra, 1985, p. 51

<sup>7</sup> CALERO CALERO, Francisco (2003) Juan Luis Vives, autor del *Lazarillo*, En: ABC Cultural. Número 618 (19-20)

<sup>8</sup> CALERO CALERO, Francisco (2004) Juan Luis Vives, autor del diálogo de Mercurio y Carón. Valencia: Ajuntament de Xativa

<sup>9</sup> BATAILLON, Marcel (1954) El sentido del "Lazarillo de Tormes". Paris, pp. 8-14

<sup>10</sup> AGULLÓ Y COBO, Mercedes (2010) A vueltas con el autor del "Lazarillo". Madrid, Calambur

<sup>11</sup> CEJADOR Y FRAUCA, Julio (1914) *La vida de Lazarillo de Tormes y de sus fortunas y adversidades*, Madrid, Clásicos Castellanos

<sup>12</sup> MÁRQUEZ VILLANUEVA, Francisco (1957) Sebastián de Horozco y *Lazarillo de Tormes*. In: *Revista de Filología Española*, XLI, 1957, pp. 253-339

<sup>13</sup> HAAN, Fonger de (1903) *An Outline of the History of the «Novela Picaresca» in Spain*, Nueva York

<sup>14</sup> MARASSO, Arturo (1941) La elaboración del *Lazarillo de Tormes*, *Boletín de la Academia Argentina de Letras*, n.º 36, pp. 597-616

<sup>15</sup> MADRIGAL, José Luis (2008) Notas sobre la autoría del *Lazarillo*. In: *Lemir*, N° 12, pp. 137-236

<sup>16</sup> COLAHAN, Clark & RODRÍGUEZ, Alfred (1995) Juan Maldonado and *Lazarillo de Tormes*. In: *Bulletin of Hispanic Studies*, LXXII, 3, pp. 289-311



## Two Spanish inventions in the XV – century



SALES:

<http://www.lulu.com/spotlight/moriscoricote>

Academia de Estudios Humanísticos de Blanca, 2016, N° 4, pp. 1-7  
 DOI: 10.13140/RG.2.2.31720.67848



Howard Mancing defended the possible authorship of Fernando de Rojas<sup>17</sup>. Alberto M. Forcadas<sup>18</sup> did the same with Bartolomé Torres Naharro. Alejo Vanegas wrote similar things as figuring in *Lazarillo* and could have been another possible author<sup>19</sup>, while Delai Brenes Carrillo<sup>20</sup> thought more of Gonzalo Pérez, the royal secretary of King Charles I of Spain. And as stated in the beginning of this study, Jordi Bilbeny came up with the hypothesis in 2007 that the book *Lazarillo de Tormes* could have been written by Juan de Timoneda.

There are several other scholars<sup>21</sup> who also have given their hypotheses about the possible authors of *Lazarillo*, and it is clear that the latest verdict has still not been delivered on the authorship of this work.

With regards to the analysis of the possible authors of *Lazarillo de Tormes* we have used many of them in the JGAAP program. It was not always possible to obtain the necessary texts of their books from the database, but we consider the input acceptable. In this way we obtained the following table:

<sup>17</sup> **MANCING, Howard** (2010) Fernando de Rojas, *La Celestina*, and *Lazarillo de Tormes*. In: Kentucky Romance Quarterly, 23:1, pp. 47-61

**RAMÍREZ LÓPEZ, Marco Antonio** (2006) Fortunas y adversidades de la autoría del *Lazarillo de Tormes* y la postura de Rosa Navarro Durán», Signos Literarios, n.º 4, julio-diciembre de 2006, Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana–Iztapalapa, México D. F., pp. 9-43

<sup>18</sup> **FORCADAS, Alberto M.** (1994) El entretreído de la “Propalladia” de Torres Naharro en el prólogo y tratado I del “*Lazarillo de Tormes*”. In: Revista de literatura, Tomo 56, N° 112, pp. 309-348

<sup>19</sup> **VANEJAS, Alejo** (1540) *Primera parte delas diferencias de libros q[ue] ay en el vniuerso. Declaradas por el maestro Alexo Uanegas ...* [Toledo, Impresa en casa de Juan de Ayala]

**RUFFINATTO, Aldo** (2001) Introducción crítica a su ed. de *La vida de Lazarillo de Tormes y de sus fortunas y adversidades*, Madrid, Castalia (Clásicos Castalia), pp. 7-87

<sup>20</sup> **BRENES CARRILLO, Delai** (1986) *Lazarillo de Tormes: Roman à clef?*, *Hispania* 69, 2, pp. 234-243

**BRENES CARRILLO, Delai** (1987) *Lazarillo, Vlixea, y Anón*, Boletín de la Biblioteca Menéndez Pelayo 63, pp. 57-104

**BRENES CARRILLO, Delai** (1992) ¿Quién es V. M. en *Lazarillo de Tormes?*», Boletín de la Menéndez Pelayo 68, pp. 73-88

<sup>21</sup> **CREWS, Daniel** (2010) Biografía y autobiografía novelesca: Datos nuevos sobre Juan de Valdés y *Lazarillo de Tormes*. In: Actas XVI Congreso Asociación Internacional de Hispanistas, 2007, Volume 2, Paris, **RAMÍREZ LÓPEZ, Marco Antonio** (2006) Fortunas y adversidades de la autoría del *Lazarillo de Tormes* y la postura de Rosa Navarro Durán. In: Signos Literarios 4, pp. 9-43



## Two Spanish inventions in the XV – century

SALES:

<http://www.lulu.com/spotlight/moriscoricote>

Academia de Estudios Humanísticos de Blanca, 2016, N° 4, pp. 1-7

DOI: 10.13140/RG.2.2.31720.67848

Proposed authors of *Lazarillo*

Year	Hipotesis	Authors	Works
1540		Alejo Vanegas	Diferencias de Libros Agonia
1550?	Attributed by M. Serrano	Cristóbal de Villalón	Viaje de Turquía Cróton
1607	Valerio Andrés Taxandro (=André Schott)	Diego Hurtado de Mendoza	Guerra de Granada
1880	Alfred Paul Victor Morel-Fatio	Alfonso de Valdés	Diálogo cosas .... Roma
1890	Alfred Morel-Fatio	Juan de Valdés Alfonso de Valdés	Diálogo de la lengua Diálogo cosas .... Roma
1903	Fonger de Haan	Lope de Rueda	Eufemia Aceitunas
1914	Julio Cejador y Frauca (José María Asensio y Toledo)	Sebastián de Horozco	Ruth Historia Evangélica Entremeses
1941	Pedro de Rua	Hernán Núñez	Treszientas
1954	Marcel Bataillon	Juan de Ortega	
1957	Francisco Márquez Villanueva (Emilio Cotarelo)	Sebastián de Horozco	Ruth Historia Evangélica Entremeses
1960	Manuel J. Asensio	Juan de Valdés Alfonso de Valdés	Diálogo de la lengua Diálogo cosas .... Roma
1961	Erika Spivakovsky	Diego Hurtado de Mendoza	Guerra de Granada
1985	Joseph V. Ricipito	Alfonso de Valdés	Diálogo cosas .... Roma
1985	Antonio Pére-Romero	Alfonso de Valdés	Diálogo cosas .... Roma
1994	Alberto M. Forcadas	Bartolomé Torres Naharro	Propalladia
1995	Clark Colahan	Juan Maldonado	Eremitoe
1995	Alfred Rodríguez	Juan Maldonado	Eremitoe
2002	José Luis Madrigal	Cervantes de Salazar	Crónica Nueva España
2003	Giancarlo Maiorino	Juan de Valdés	Diálogo de la lengua
2003	Rosa Navarro Durán	Alfonso de Valdés	Diálogo cosas .... Roma
2003	Francisco Calero Calero	Juan Luis Vives	Diálogo de Mercurio ...
2005	Antonio Pérez-Romero	Alfonso de Valdés	Diálogo cosas .... Roma
2007	Jordi Bilbeny	Juan de Timoneda	Patranuela Caminantes
2008	José Luis Madrigal	Juan Arce de Otálora	Palatino
2010	Mercedes Agulló y Cobo	Diego Hurtado de Mendoza	Guerra de Granada
2010	Howard Mancing	Fernando de Rojas	La Celestina



Two Spanish inventions in the XV – century



SALES:

<http://www.lulu.com/spotlight/moriscoricote>

Academia de Estudios Humanísticos de Blanca, 2016, N° 4, pp. 1-7  
DOI: 10.13140/RG.2.2.31720.67848



Thereafter we made the corresponding analysis with JGAAP to find out who could have been the author of *Lazarillo de Tormes*:

Lazarillo prueba2.txt D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\lazarillo prueba2.txt

Canonicalizers:

Normalize Whitespace

EventDrivers:

Character NGrams n : 2

EventCullers:

Most Common Events numevents : 50

Analysis:

Nearest Neighbor Driver with metric Cosine Distance

1. Juan de Timoneda -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\TimonedaCaminantes.txt 0.01689869330397309
2. Juan de Timoneda -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\Timoneda Patrañuela.txt 0.01790512935070432
3. Juan Luis Vives? -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\dialogo de mercurio y caron.txt 0.02595786985520432
4. Lope de Rueda -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\LopedRuedaEufemia.txt 0.02799955062814663
5. Cristóbal de Villalón -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\Crotalon Villalon.txt 0.03129811981849484
6. Alejo Venegas -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\AgoniaVenegasAlejo.txt 0.03197072936973566
7. Alfonso de Valdés -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\valdesalfonsodialogoroma.txt 0.032040089907964364
8. Sebastián de Horozco -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\HorozcoEntremeses.txt 0.03352508895090567
9. Lope de Rueda -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\lopederuedaAceitunas.txt 0.03437977692992322
10. Aragonese author -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\celestina obra completa.txt 0.03505284536375208
11. Juan de Valdés -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\valdesJuan dialogolengua.txt 0.03538966422740775
12. Sebastián de Horozco -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\HorozcoRuth.txt 0.03685299888707616
13. Sebastián de Horozco -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\HorozcoHistoriaEvangelica.txt 0.03875436850359848
14. Cristóbal de Villalón -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\ villalonTurquia.txt 0.03908884198557494
15. Diego Hurtado de Mendoza -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\diegohurtadodemendoza granadaguerra.txt 0.04068334514441707
16. Juan Arce Otálora -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\ArcePalatinoPinciano.txt 0.04130752139775329
17. Bartolomé Torres Naharro -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\propaladiaalgunos textos.txt 0.04918261683225822
18. Cervantes de Salazar -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\CronicaNuevaEspañaSalazar.txt 0.060970347647504086
19. Alejo Venegas -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\Diferencias Venegas.txt 0.08975627682337639



## Two Spanish inventions in the XV – century



SALES:

<http://www.lulu.com/spotlight/moriscoricote>

Academia de Estudios Humanísticos de Blanca, 2016, N° 4, pp. 1-7  
DOI: 10.13140/RG.2.2.31720.67848



Lazarillo prueba2.txt D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\lazarillo prueba2.txt

Canonicizers:

Normalize Whitespace

EventDrivers:

Character NGrams n : 4

EventCullers:

Most Common Events numevents : 50

Analysis:

Nearest Neighbor Driver with metric Cosine Distance

1. Juan de Timoneda -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\TimonedaCaminantes.txt 0.030573359969583436
2. Bartolomé Torres Naharro -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\propaladiaalgunos textos.txt 0.04527110385695399
3. Lope de Rueda -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\lopederuedaAceitunas.txt 0.0465461796219393
4. Alfonso de Valdés -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\valdesalfonsodialogoroma.txt 0.04865159545005393
5. Juan de Timoneda -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\Timoneda Patrañuela.txt 0.05169818204769405
6. Juan de Valdés -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\valdesJuan dialogolengua.txt 0.0565975915671425
7. Cristóbal de Villalón -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\CrotalonVillalon.txt 0.05821935969681846
8. Aragonese author -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\celestina obra completa.txt 0.05882177431186264
9. Juan Luis Vives? -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\dialogo de mercurio y caron.txt 0.06128162683634386
10. Sebastián de Horozco -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\HorozcoHistoriaEvangelica.txt 0.06254441928369303
11. Lope de Rueda -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\LopedeRuedaEufemia.txt 0.06283380712307074
12. Alejo Venegas -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\AgoniaVenegasAlejo.txt 0.06292996349040858
13. Sebastián de Horozco -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\HorozcoRuth.txt 0.06406250935633362
14. Juan Arce Otálora -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\ArcePalatinoPinciano.txt 0.07400109487859219
15. Sebastián de Horozco -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\HorozcoEntremeses.txt 0.07552208025126494
16. Cristóbal de Villalón -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\ villalonTurquia.txt 0.07754625887050726
17. Cervantes de Salazar -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\CronicaNuevaEspañaSalazar.txt 0.11316143482600294
18. Diego Hurtado de Mendoza -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\diegohurtadodemendoza granadaguerra.txt 0.13768609902652507
19. Alejo Venegas -D:\Programas text analysis\Signatura\Diferencias Venegas.txt 0.1554524759466711

## CONCLUSION

The JGAAP analysis showed that the texts of *Lazarillo de Tormes* are closest to the textual fingerprint of Juan de Timoneda. Our experience with Juan de Timoneda is that he copied various books and put his name on them. More study is needed to find out whether the texts of his books *Caminantes* and *Patrañuela* are really written by Juan de Timoneda. On the other hand we may consider the results of JGAAP good enough for a new and suitable line of investigation of the authorship of *Lazarillo de Tormes* by Juan de Timoneda.